

Summary of Validation Research
Edward G. Feil, Ph.D.
Validation Training Institute
www.vfvalidation.org
July 2014

Research on Validation has found positive results older adults with some forms of dementia experience:

- increased communication,
- increased positive affect,
- reduced aggressive behavior,
- caregivers feel more capable of handling difficult situations and have more pleasure in their work
- less need to use psychotropic medications

Randomized experimental and quasi-experimental studies include Tondi et al (2007), Toseland and colleagues (1997), Tondi and colleagues (2006), Peoples (1982), Brack (1996), Babins and colleagues (1985) and Canon (1996). While many of these studies have limitations (e.g. low sample size), this RCT research illustrates the empirical evidence supporting the effectiveness of the Validation therapy.

Most recently to assess the effectiveness of Validation, Tondi et al (2007) carried out a study with 50 patients with severe AD (Mini-Mental State Examination, MMSE < 13) divided in two groups, those who received Validation (both individual and group) and patients who did not that served as the control. They collected the Neuropsychiatric Inventory (NPI) and the Bedford Alzheimer nursing severity scale (BANSS) before and after the intervention period. The results showed a marked decrease of the average NPI symptom score in the case group (from 22.0 to 9.5) vs. a rise in the control group (from 21.7 to 24.1). Agitation, apathy, irritability and nighttime behaviors were the most improved NPI items among the subjects who received Validation. In these patients also the NPI distress score turned out reduced, vs. a small increase in the control group. Subjects in the Validation condition showed significant improvements (i.e. large effect size) on the Bedford Alzheimer Nursing Severity Scale (Appollonio et al., 2005) and Neuropsychiatric Inventory (Kaufer et al., 2000) while control participants increased or maintained their severity ratings. Experimental subjects decreased their scores by an effect size of .82 and .54 on the BANSS and NPI, respectively. These effects sizes fall within the medium-to-large effects range of treatment magnitude (Bloom, Hill, Black, & Lipsey, 2006). Although the small number of subjects enlisted does not allow us to draw firm inferences, the study suggests that Validation is able to reduce the severity and frequency of behavioral and psychological symptoms of dementia, thus improving the relationship with and the management of patients without any side effects.

Toseland and colleagues (1997) conducted a randomized control trial demonstrating Validation's empirical evidence of effectiveness. In four skilled-care nursing homes, 88 in-patient elderly with AD were randomly assigned to Validation, an attention control

condition, and usual-care. Nursing staff blind to condition rated participating patients' behavior at baseline, 3 months and 1 year. Residents in the Validation group were reported to have fewer incidents of physical and verbal aggressive behavior on the Cohen-Mansfield Agitation Inventory (Cohen-Mansfield, 1986), a 30-item with good interrater reliability (Cohen-Mansfield, et al., 1989).

In another randomized trial (Peoples, 1982), 30 elderly patients with dementia randomized to one of three groups: (a) Validation, (b) Reality Orientation or (c) usual care. Patients randomized to the 2 intervention conditions (Validation and Reality Orientation) participated in daily group meetings for 30 minutes per day for 6 weeks. At the end of the six-week intervention period, research staff completed observations and rating scales. Results showed that patients in the Validation condition significantly increased communication, decreased aggressive behavior, and were more responsive to staff than patients in other conditions.

Brack's (1996) dissertation in Montréal with twenty-eight participants randomly assigned (within French & English languages) to one of two groups: (a) Validation therapy or (b) attention-control (non-specific activities). Intervention occurred over a six-month period with approximately two 30-minute sessions per week. There was a trend of maintained or improved levels of functioning. Specific cognitive functions such as concentration and language showed improvement. Due to low sample size, there were no statistically significant results.

Babins and colleagues (1988) randomly assigned 12 elderly in-patients with dementia to either validation or control conditions. Validation groups were held twice per week for 11 weeks for a duration of 45 minutes per week. Direct observations of patients in the validation condition showed increased communication (talking, eye contact) and positive affect (smiling) relative to the control condition. These effects sizes fall within the medium-to-large effects range of treatment magnitude (Bloom, Hill, Black, & Lipsey, 2006). Low sample size limited statistically significant results.

Canon's (1996) dissertation at 5 central Texas long-term care facilities had similar results with paraprofessional and family caregivers self-selected to receive Validation workshop (experimental) or Validation at end of study (wait-list control). Nineteen family and thirty-nine staff members (N=58) were recruited for the study. Participants completed the Dementia Caregiver Quality of Relationship Inventory (DCQRI) and the Interpersonal Communication Satisfaction Inventory (ICSI) (Hecht, 1978). Data analysis consisted of separate repeated measures analysis of variance tests, each with a varying covariate; one for the ICSI and another for the DCQRI. Findings indicated a significant increase in communication satisfaction for dementia caregivers who received Validation training when compared to control.

In addition, many descriptive and anecdotal reports in the literature confirm the effectiveness of the validation approach (Benjamin, 1999).

Günther (2004) in Switzerland studied a group of institutional caregivers before, directly after, and 8-months after receiving training in Validation. Caregivers reported that Validation was helpful in the management of conflict situations and had a more fully satisfying care situation.

Sharp and colleagues (2004) in Australia compared changes in behavioral problems before and after the use of Validation in two nursing homes. Most residents made substantial improvements, which was surprising given the typical pattern of decline as noted by the study's authors. In a survey of 16 nursing homes (directors and staff), results showed positive ratings in terms of staff behavior (Alprin & Feil, 1980). Bleathman & Morton (1992) found that interaction and communication markedly increased for two out of three patients with dementia. When returned to the comparison condition (reality therapy), subjects returned to baseline levels.

Research has found that patients had increased self-confidence, verbal communication and gait was improved (Sipola, 2002); levels of agitation were reduced and levels of positive behavior were increased (Munsch, 2000).

In another non-experimental study with 18 patients 80-years-old or older with dementia, staff received training in validation and implemented the intervention and found that subjects' communication dramatically improved (increase in the use of proper nouns that function as subjects and objects of verbs, increased meaningful self references, expanded their repertoire of appropriate qualifiers (Fritz, 1986).

A case study approach showed that the use of Reality Orientation produced negative responses in comparison with the use of Validation (Dietch, 1989).

Prentczynski's doctoral dissertation showed reduced levels of disorientation, less need for medication and improvement in verbal communication, eye contact and positive affect pre and post evaluation of three elderly residents (1991).

Fine & Rouse-Bane (1995) studied residents at a new 44-bed dementia care unit that were exhibiting severe aggressive behavior. Following the validation training, there were positive changes to both caregivers and clients: the frequency, appropriateness and effectiveness of focused communication techniques increased dramatically, as well as the reduction of serious behavioral incidents and the use of psychotropic medications.

REFERENCES CITED

- Alprin, S. I. & Feil, N. (1980) Study to determine results of implementing Validation therapy. Unpublished Manuscript. College of Education, Cleveland State University.
- Appollonio, Gori, Riva, Spiga, Ferrari, Ferrarese, & Frattola (2005) Assessing early to late stage dementia: the TSI and BANS-S scales in the nursing home. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*_vol 20 pp 1138-1145

- Babins (1985) Group approaches with the disoriented elderly: Reality Orientation and Validation Therapies, unpublished Master's Thesis, McGill University, Montreal
- Babins (1988). Conceptual Analysis of Validation Therapy International Journal of Aging and Human Development. Vol 26(3)1988 pp 161-169.
- Babins, Dillion & Merovitz(1988). The effects of validation therapy on disoriented elderly. Activities, Adaptation & Aging, Vol 12(1/2)pp 73-86.
- Benjamin (1999) Validation: A communication alternative. In Voliver & Bloom-Charette. Enhancing the quality of life in advanced dementia. Taylor and Francis. pp 107-125
- Bleathman, C., & Morton, I. (1992). Validation therapy: extracts from 20 groups with dementia sufferers. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 17(6), 658-666.
- Bloom, H., Hill, C., Black, A.R., & Lipsey, M. (2006). Using effect size to judge success: How big is big enough? Presented at the Institute of Education Sciences Research Conference. June 15th, 2006. Washington, DC.
- Brack (1996). Validation therapy with disoriented very old persons: Impact of group interventions on activities of daily living, on aspects of behaviour, cognition and general well-being. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Montreal.
- Canon (1995). The Effect of Validation Therapy Training on Satisfaction with Communication and Quality of Relationship Between Primary Caregivers and Demented Residents in Long Term Care. Unpublished doctoral dissertation,
- Cohen-Mansfield, J. (1986). Agitated behaviors in the elderly: II. Preliminary results in the cognitively deteriorated. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*.
- Cohen-Mansfield, J. (1991) Instruction Manual for the Cohen-Mansfield Agitation Inventory.
- Cohen-Mansfield, J. (1997). Conceptualization of agitation: Results based on the Cohen-Mansfield agitation inventory and the agitation behavior mapping instrument. *International Psychogeriatrics*, 8(s 3), 309-315.
- Dietch, J.; Hewett, L. & Jones, S. (1989). Adverse Effects of Reality Orientation. *JAGS*. Vol 37 pp 974-976.
- Feil, N. (1967) Group Therapy in a Home for the Aged. *The Gerontologist*, vol 7(3)pp 192-195
- Feil, N. (1972). Presented at the 25th Annual Meeting of the Gerontological Society. (Summary of Research Data).
- Feil, N. (1991). Validation therapy with late-onset dementia populations. In Jones, Meisen & Bere. Interventions in Care Facilities. Chapter 12 (pp. 199-218)
- Feil, N. (2002). *The Validation Breakthrough* (2nd ed.). Baltimore, MD: Health Professions Press.
- Feil, N. (2003). *V/F Validation: The Feil Method* (3rd ed.). Cleveland, OH: Edward Feil Productions.
- Feil, N.(1985) Resolution: The Final Life Task. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, vol 25(2), Spr 85 pp 91-105
- Fine & Rouse-Bane (1995). Using Validation Techniques to Improve Communication with Cognitively Impaired Older Adults. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. June 1995. Pp 39-45
- Fritz (1986). The Language of Resolution Among the Old-Old: The Effects of Validation Therapy on Two Levels of Cognitive Confusion. Speech and Association Convention. Nov 12-16, 1986. Chicago Illinois.
- Günther (2004) Evaluationsstudie über die Praxiserfolge von Validation nach Feil am Beispiel eines TERTIANUM ZfP Validation-Anwenderseminars. Abschlussbericht. Trier, den 05.

- Günther, Andre (2004) English summary of 'Evaluation of the practical results of Validation, based on a Swiss Validation Worker course. Research report available from Tertanium.
- Hecht, 1978 Interpersonal Communication Satisfaction Inventory (ICSI) (Hecht, 1978)
- Hisrich, R; LanganFox, J; Grant, S (2007). Entrepreneurship Research and Practice: A Call to Action for Psychology. *American Psychologist* Vol 62(6) pp 575-589
- Holmes, D., Teresi, J., & Monaco, C.(1992) Special care units in nursing homes: prevalence in five states. *The Gerontologist*, Vol 32, Issue 2 191-196, The Gerontological Society of America. Hebrew Home for the Aged, Riverdale, NY 10471
- Hougham; Sachs; Danner; Mintz; Patterson; Roberts; Siminoff; Sugarman; Whitehouse; Wirshing (2003). Empirical Research on Informed Consent with the Cognitively Impaired. *Ethics & Human Research* Vol 25(5) pp 26-32
- Hox, Joop.(2010). *Multilevel analysis: Techniques and applications*, (2nd ed.). New York: Routledge.
- Humphreys, K., Winzelberg, A. & Klaw E. (2000). Psychologists' ethical responsibilities in the Internet-based groups: Issues, strategies, and a call for dialogue. *Professional Psychology: Research & Practice*, 31(5), 493-496.
- Jacobs, G.A., Latham, L.E., & Brown, M.S. (1988). Test-retest reliability of the State-Trait Personality Inventory and the Anger Expression Scale. *Anxiety Research*, 1, 263-265.
- Johns, Alan & Sharp, Colin (1991). Validation Therapy: An Evaluation of a Program at the South Port Community Nursing Home. Paper for Australian Affiliation of Voluntary Care Association (A.A.V.C.A.). conference, Melbourne, Victoria. November 10-13, 1991
- Jones, Gemma M.M.(1997). Geriatric Psychiatry. *Current Opinion in Psychiatry*. 10(4) pp 326-332.
- Kane, B.; & Sands, D., (1998) for the AMIA Internet Working Group, task Force on Guidelines for the Use of Clinic-Patient Electronic Mail. *Journal of the American Medical Informatics Association* American Medical Informatics Association. Vol 5(1) Pub by Hanley & Belfus, Inc., Philadelphia, PA.
- Karlawish, Jason H. T.;Knopman, David;Clark, Christopher M.;Morris, John C.;Marson, Daniel;Whitehouse, Peter J.;Kawas, Claudia H.(2002). Informed Consent for Alzheimer's Disease Clinical Trials: A Survey of Clinical Investigators . *IRB: Ethics & Human Research*. Vol 24(5) pp 1
- Karlin, BE; Humphreys, K (2007). Improving Medicare Coverage of Psychological Services for Older Americans. *American Psychologist* Vol 62(7) pp 637-649.
- Kitwood, T. (1993). Frames of reference for an understanding of dementia. *Ageing and later life*, 1, 100.
- Kitwood, T. (1997) *Dementia reconsidered*. Open University Press, Buckingham, UK.
- Munsch (2000) *Prise en Charges des Troubles Psycho-Comportementaux Chez des Personnes Agees en Institution, Atteintes de Deficiences Cognitives*. Faculté de médecine. Université de Limoges.
- Peoples, Marlene (1982). Thesis: Validation Therapy Versus Reality Orientation as Treatment for the Institutionalized Disoriented Elderly. Presented to: The Graduate Faculty of the University of Akron.
- Prentczynski_THESE de DOCTORAT en MEDICINE (1991). *La Personne Agee en Perte d'Autonomie Psychique: la méthode de Validation et ses apports dans un service de Gériologie*

- Sharp, Dr. Colin: Prepared by P.E.R.S.O.N.A.L. Research and Evaluation Consultancy Pty Ltd (1989)_Validation Therapy: An Australian Evaluation. Final Report for Monitoring and Evaluation of the Validation Therapy Plus Programme. For South Port Community Nursing Home
- Sipola & Lumijarvi (2002) Validaatiotyöntekijäkurssin käyneiden kokemuksia validaatiomenetelmän käytöstä. Tampereen Kaupunkilähetys ry ja Sopimusvuorisäätiö.
- Söderlund, M (2013) *Attitude and communication in the meeting with persons with dementia: evaluation of Validation method training* (Doctor's thesis, Karolinska Institutet Stockholm, Sweden). Retrieved from https://openarchive.ki.se/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10616/41633/Thesis_Mona_S%C3%B6derlund.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y
- Schwarz, R (2011) *The Not Yet Seen: an Educational Example from Elderly Care* (Master's thesis abstract, Södertörn University, School of Culture and Communication). Retrieved from <http://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A462036&dswid=8866>
- Tondi, L., Ribani, L., Bottazzi, M., Viscomi, G., & Vulcano, V. (2007). Validation therapy (VT) in nursing home: a case-control study. *Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics*, 44, 407-411.
- Toseland, Diehl, Freeman, Naleppa & McCallion (1997) The Impact of Validation Group Therapy on Nursing Home Residents With Dementia. *The Journal of Applied Gerontology*. Vol 16(1) pp 31-51.
- Weil, J (1948) Case Work Service on the Aged. *Geriatrics*. March-April. Vol 3(2)